



GLENN HEGAR TEXAS COMPTROLLER OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS

P.O. Box 13528 • Austin, TX 78711-3528

September 18, 2020

AMENDED CERTIFICATION

Gordon Thomas
Superintendent
Benjamin Independent School District
300 W. Hays St.
Benjamin, Texas 79505

Re: Amended Certificate for Limitation on Appraised Value of Property for School District Maintenance and Operations taxes by and between Benjamin Independent School District and Griffin Trail Wind, LLC, Application 1353

Dear Superintendent Thomas:

This application (Application 1353) was originally submitted on March 15, 2019, to the Benjamin Independent School District (school district) by Griffin Trail Wind, LLC (applicant) for a limitation on appraised value under the provisions of Tax Code Chapter 313^[1]. On July 16, 2019, the Comptroller issued written notice that the applicant submitted a completed application; and later issued a certificate for a limitation on appraised value on September 4, 2019. The applicant and school district executed an agreement for a limitation on appraised value (agreement) on October 3, 2019.

On July 14, 2020, the Comptroller received an amendment to move the start of the limitation from 2021 to 2022 and decrease the number of turbines. This presents the Comptroller's review of that amendment per Section 10.2 of the agreement and determinations required:

- 1) under Section 313.025(h) to determine if the property meets the requirements of Section 313.024 for eligibility for a limitation on appraised value under Chapter 313, Subchapter C; and
- 2) under Section 313.025(d), to issue a certificate for a limitation on appraised value of the property and provide the certificate to the governing body of the school district or provide the governing body a written explanation of the Comptroller's decision not to issue a certificate, using the criteria set out in Section 313.026.

Determination required by 313.025(h)

The information provided by the applicant related to eligibility has not changed and therefore, the Comptroller has determined that the property meets the requirements of Section 313.024 for eligibility for a limitation on appraised value under Chapter 313, Subchapter C.

^[1] All statutory references are to the Texas Tax Code, unless otherwise noted.

Certificate decision required by 313.025(d)

Determination required by 313.026(c)(1)

The information provided by the applicant has not changed and therefore, the Comptroller has determined that the project proposed by the applicant is reasonably likely to generate tax revenue in an amount sufficient to offset the school district's maintenance and operations *ad valorem tax* revenue lost as a result of the agreement before the 25th anniversary of the beginning of the limitation period.

Determination required by 313.026(c)(2)

Comptroller has still determined that the limitation on appraised value is a determining factor in the applicant's decision to invest capital and construct the project in this state.

Based on these determinations, the Comptroller issues a certificate for a limitation on appraised value for the amendment.

The Comptroller's review of the application assumes the accuracy and completeness of the statements in the application. If the application is approved by the school district, the applicant shall perform according to the provisions of the Texas Economic Development Act Agreement (Form 50-826) executed with the school district. The school district shall comply with and enforce the stipulations, provisions, terms, and conditions of the agreement, applicable Texas Administrative Code and Chapter 313, per TAC 9.1054(i)(3).

This certificate is no longer valid if the application is modified, the information presented in the application changes, or the limitation agreement does not conform to the application. Additionally, this certificate is contingent on the school district approving and executing the amendment to the agreement by December 31, 2020.

Should you have any questions, please contact Will Counihan, Director, Data Analysis & Transparency, by email at will.counihan@cpa.texas.gov or by phone toll-free at 1-800-531-5441, ext. 6-0758, or at 512-936-0758.

Sincerely,

DocuSigned by:

11EA6DEF0EC441E...
Lisa Craven
Deputy Comptroller

Enclosure

cc: Will Counihan

Amended Attachment A - Economic Impact Analysis

The following tables summarize the Comptroller's economic impact analysis of Griffin Trail Wind, LLC (project) applying to Benjamin Independent School District (district), as required by Tax Code, 313.026 and Texas Administrative Code 9.1055(d)(2).

Table 1 is a summary of investment, employment and tax impact of Griffin Trail Wind, LLC.

	Original	Amendment No. 1
Applicant	Griffin Trail Wind, LLC	Griffin Trail Wind, LLC
Tax Code, 313.024 Eligibility Category	Wind	Wind
School District	Benjamin ISD	Benjamin ISD
2017-2018 Average Daily Attendance	101	101
County	Knox	Knox
Proposed Total Investment in District	\$97,803,800	\$91,086,000
Proposed Qualified Investment	\$97,803,800	\$91,086,000
Limitation Amount	\$20,000,000	\$20,000,000
Qualifying Time Period (Full Years)	2020-2021	2020-2021
Number of new qualifying jobs committed to by applicant	3*	3*
Number of new non-qualifying jobs estimated by applicant	0	0
Average weekly wage of qualifying jobs committed to by applicant	\$935	\$935
Minimum weekly wage required for each qualifying job by Tax Code, 313.021(5)(B)	\$935	\$935
Minimum annual wage committed to by applicant for qualified jobs	\$48,596	\$48,596
Minimum weekly wage required for non-qualifying jobs	\$786	\$786
Minimum annual wage required for non-qualifying jobs	\$40,873	\$40,873
Investment per Qualifying Job	\$32,601,267	\$30,362,000
Estimated M&O levy without any limit (15 years)	\$9,116,723	\$8,510,674
Estimated M&O levy with Limitation (15 years)	\$3,991,691	\$3,920,731
Estimated gross M&O tax benefit (15 years)	\$5,125,032	\$4,589,943

* Applicant is requesting district to waive requirement to create minimum number of qualifying jobs pursuant to Tax Code, 313.025 (f-1).

Table 2 is the estimated statewide economic impact of Griffin Trail Wind, LLC (modeled).

Year	Employment			Personal Income		
	Direct	Indirect + Induced	Total	Direct	Indirect + Induced	Total
2020	10	13	23	\$500,000	\$1,135,450	\$1,635,450
2021	80	98	177,975	\$4,000,000	\$9,381,930	\$13,381,930
2022	3	10	13	\$145,787	\$1,769,503	\$1,915,290
2023	3	10	13	\$145,787	\$1,539,523	\$1,685,310
2024	3	6	9	\$145,787	\$1,150,273	\$1,296,060
2025	3	4	7	\$145,787	\$919,693	\$1,065,480
2026	3	4	7	\$145,787	\$794,073	\$939,860
2027	3	4	7	\$145,787	\$741,903	\$887,690
2028	3	4	7	\$145,787	\$743,823	\$889,610
2029	3	4	7	\$145,787	\$776,853	\$922,640
2030	3	5	8	\$145,787	\$826,783	\$972,570
2031	3	5	8	\$145,787	\$883,423	\$1,029,210
2032	3	6	9	\$145,787	\$940,253	\$1,086,040
2033	3	5	8	\$145,787	\$937,783	\$1,083,570
2034	3	5	8	\$145,787	\$961,243	\$1,107,030
2035	3	5	8	\$145,787	\$988,863	\$1,134,650
2036	3	5	8	\$145,787	\$1,014,293	\$1,160,080

Source: CPA REMI, Griffin Trail Wind, LLC

Table 3 examines the estimated direct impact on ad valorem taxes to the region if all taxes are assessed.

Year	Estimated Taxable Value for I&S	Estimated Taxable Value for M&O	Tax Rate*	BenjaminISD I&S Tax Levy	Benjamin ISD M&O Tax Levy	M&O and I&S Tax Levies	Knox County Tax Levy	Knox County Hospital District Tax Levy	Rolling Plains Groundwater Tax Levy	Estimated Total Property Taxes
				0.0000	1.0684		0.7448	0.3930	0.0262	
2021	\$2,125,000	\$2,125,000		\$0	\$22,704	\$22,704	\$15,827	\$8,351	\$556	\$47,437
2022	\$89,051,800	\$89,051,800		\$0	\$951,429	\$951,429	\$663,258	\$349,965	\$23,296	\$1,987,948
2023	\$81,927,600	\$81,927,600		\$0	\$875,314	\$875,314	\$610,197	\$321,967	\$21,432	\$1,828,911
2024	\$75,373,400	\$75,373,400		\$0	\$805,289	\$805,289	\$561,381	\$296,210	\$19,718	\$1,682,598
2025	\$69,343,600	\$69,343,600		\$0	\$740,867	\$740,867	\$516,471	\$272,513	\$18,140	\$1,547,992
2026	\$63,796,100	\$63,796,100		\$0	\$681,598	\$681,598	\$475,153	\$250,712	\$16,689	\$1,424,152
2027	\$58,692,400	\$58,692,400		\$0	\$627,070	\$627,070	\$437,141	\$230,655	\$15,354	\$1,310,220
2028	\$53,997,000	\$53,997,000		\$0	\$576,904	\$576,904	\$402,170	\$212,203	\$14,126	\$1,205,402
2029	\$49,677,200	\$49,677,200		\$0	\$530,751	\$530,751	\$369,996	\$195,226	\$12,996	\$1,108,969
2030	\$45,703,100	\$45,703,100		\$0	\$488,292	\$488,292	\$340,397	\$179,609	\$11,956	\$1,020,253
2031	\$42,046,800	\$42,046,800		\$0	\$449,228	\$449,228	\$313,165	\$165,240	\$10,999	\$938,632
2032	\$38,683,100	\$38,683,100		\$0	\$413,290	\$413,290	\$288,112	\$152,021	\$10,119	\$863,542
2033	\$35,588,400	\$35,588,400		\$0	\$380,226	\$380,226	\$265,062	\$139,859	\$9,310	\$794,458
2034	\$32,741,400	\$32,741,400		\$0	\$349,809	\$349,809	\$243,858	\$128,670	\$8,565	\$730,903
2035	\$30,122,000	\$30,122,000		\$0	\$321,823	\$321,823	\$224,349	\$118,376	\$7,880	\$672,428
2036	\$27,712,300	\$27,712,300		\$0	\$296,078	\$296,078	\$206,401	\$108,907	\$7,250	\$618,636
			Total	\$0	\$8,510,674	\$8,510,674	\$5,932,937	\$3,130,484	\$208,386	\$17,782,480

Source: CPA, Griffin Trail Wind, LLC

*Tax Rate per \$100 Valuation

Table 4 examines the estimated direct impact on ad valorem taxes to the school district and Knox County, with all property tax incentives sought being granted using estimated market value from the application. The project has applied for a value limitation under Chapter 313, Tax Code and abatement with the County

The difference noted in the last line is the difference between the totals in Table 3 and Table 4.

Year	Estimated Taxable Value for I&S	Estimated Taxable Value for M&O		BenjaminISD I&S Tax Levy	Benjamin ISD M&O Tax Levy	M&O and I&S Tax Levies	Knox County Tax Levy	Knox County Hospital District Tax Levy	Rolling Plains Groundwater Tax Levy	Estimated Total Property Taxes
			Tax Rate*	0.0000	1.0684		0.7448	0.3930	0.0262	
2021	\$2,125,000	\$2,125,000		\$0	\$22,704	\$22,704	\$15,827	\$8,351	\$556	\$46,882
2022	\$89,051,800	\$20,000,000		\$0	\$213,680	\$213,680	\$663,258	\$349,965	\$23,296	\$1,226,902
2023	\$81,927,600	\$20,000,000		\$0	\$213,680	\$213,680	\$610,197	\$321,967	\$21,432	\$1,145,844
2024	\$75,373,400	\$20,000,000		\$0	\$213,680	\$213,680	\$561,381	\$296,210	\$19,718	\$1,071,271
2025	\$69,343,600	\$20,000,000		\$0	\$213,680	\$213,680	\$516,471	\$272,513	\$18,140	\$1,002,665
2026	\$63,796,100	\$20,000,000		\$0	\$213,680	\$213,680	\$475,153	\$250,712	\$16,689	\$939,546
2027	\$58,692,400	\$20,000,000		\$0	\$213,680	\$213,680	\$437,141	\$230,655	\$15,354	\$881,476
2028	\$53,997,000	\$20,000,000		\$0	\$213,680	\$213,680	\$402,170	\$212,203	\$14,126	\$828,052
2029	\$49,677,200	\$20,000,000		\$0	\$213,680	\$213,680	\$369,996	\$195,226	\$12,996	\$778,902
2030	\$45,703,100	\$20,000,000		\$0	\$213,680	\$213,680	\$340,397	\$179,609	\$11,956	\$733,685
2031	\$42,046,800	\$20,000,000		\$0	\$213,680	\$213,680	\$313,165	\$165,240	\$10,999	\$692,084
2032	\$38,683,100	\$38,683,100		\$0	\$413,290	\$413,290	\$288,112	\$152,021	\$10,119	\$853,423
2033	\$35,588,400	\$35,588,400		\$0	\$380,226	\$380,226	\$265,062	\$139,859	\$9,310	\$785,148
2034	\$32,741,400	\$32,741,400		\$0	\$349,809	\$349,809	\$243,858	\$128,670	\$8,565	\$722,337
2035	\$30,122,000	\$30,122,000		\$0	\$321,823	\$321,823	\$224,349	\$118,376	\$7,880	\$664,549
2036	\$27,712,300	\$27,712,300		\$0	\$296,078	\$296,078	\$206,401	\$108,907	\$7,250	\$611,386
			Total	\$0	\$3,920,731	\$3,920,731	\$5,932,937	\$3,130,484	\$208,386	\$12,984,152
			Diff	\$0	\$4,589,943	\$4,589,943	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$4,798,328

Assumes School Value Limitation and Tax Abatements with the County.

Source: CPA, Griffin Trail Wind, LLC

*Tax Rate per \$100 Valuation

Disclaimer: This examination is based on information from the application submitted to the school district and forwarded to the comptroller. It is intended to meet the statutory requirement of Chapter 313 of the Tax Code and is not intended for any other purpose.

Attachment B – Tax Revenue before 25th Anniversary of Limitation Start

This represents the Comptroller’s determination that Griffin Trail Wind, LLC (project) is reasonably likely to generate, before the 25th anniversary of the beginning of the limitation period, tax revenue in an amount sufficient to offset the school district maintenance and operations ad valorem tax revenue lost as a result of the agreement. This evaluation is based on an analysis of the estimated M&O portion of the school district property tax levy directly related to this project, using estimated taxable values provided in the application.

	Tax Year	Estimated ISD M&O Tax Levy Generated (Annual)	Estimated ISD M&O Tax Levy Generated (Cumulative)	Estimated ISD M&O Tax Levy Loss as Result of Agreement (Annual)	Estimated ISD M&O Tax Levy Loss as Result of Agreement (Cumulative)
Limitation Pre-Years	2019	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
	2020	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
	2021	\$22,704	\$22,704	\$0	\$0
Limitation Period (10 Years)	2022	\$213,680	\$236,384	\$737,749	\$737,749
	2023	\$213,680	\$450,064	\$661,634	\$1,399,384
	2024	\$213,680	\$663,744	\$591,609	\$1,990,993
	2025	\$213,680	\$877,424	\$527,187	\$2,518,180
	2026	\$213,680	\$1,091,104	\$467,918	\$2,986,098
	2027	\$213,680	\$1,304,784	\$413,390	\$3,399,487
	2028	\$213,680	\$1,518,464	\$363,224	\$3,762,711
	2029	\$213,680	\$1,732,144	\$317,071	\$4,079,783
	2030	\$213,680	\$1,945,824	\$274,612	\$4,354,395
	2031	\$213,680	\$2,159,504	\$235,548	\$4,589,943
Maintain Viable Presence (5 Years)	2032	\$413,290	\$2,572,794	\$0	\$4,589,943
	2033	\$380,226	\$2,953,020	\$0	\$4,589,943
	2034	\$349,809	\$3,302,829	\$0	\$4,589,943
	2035	\$321,823	\$3,624,653	\$0	\$4,589,943
	2036	\$296,078	\$3,920,731	\$0	\$4,589,943
Additional Years as Required by 313.026(c)(1) (10 Years)	2037	\$272,392	\$4,193,123	\$0	\$4,589,943
	2038	\$250,601	\$4,443,723	\$0	\$4,589,943
	2039	\$230,552	\$4,674,276	\$0	\$4,589,943
	2040	\$212,108	\$4,886,384	\$0	\$4,589,943
	2041	\$195,139	\$5,081,523	\$0	\$4,589,943
	2042	\$179,529	\$5,261,052	\$0	\$4,589,943
	2043	\$165,166	\$5,426,218	\$0	\$4,589,943
	2044	\$151,953	\$5,578,171	\$0	\$4,589,943
	2045	\$139,796	\$5,717,967	\$0	\$4,589,943
	2046	\$128,613	\$5,846,580	\$0	\$4,589,943

\$5,846,580

is greater than

\$4,589,943

Analysis Summary

Is the project reasonably likely to generate tax revenue in an amount sufficient to offset the M&O levy loss as a result of the limitation agreement?

Yes

Source: CPA, Griffin Trail Wind, LLC

Disclaimer: This examination is based on information from the application submitted to the school district and forwarded to the comptroller. It is intended to meet the statutory requirement of Chapter 313 of the Tax Code and is not intended for any other purpose.