



**GLENN HEGAR** TEXAS COMPTROLLER OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS

P.O. Box 13528 • Austin, TX 78711-3528

October 15, 2019

AMENDED CERTIFICATION

Jack Lee  
Superintendent  
Blooming Grove Independent School District  
212 West Grady Street  
Blooming Grove, Texas 76626

Re: Amended Certificate for Limitation on Appraised Value of Property for School District Maintenance and Operations taxes by and between Blooming Grove Independent School District and Clean Vision Solar, LLC, Application 1279

Dear Superintendent Lee:

This application (Application 1279) was originally submitted on August 8, 2018, to the Blooming Grove Independent School District (school district) by Clean Vision Solar, LLC (applicant) for a limitation on appraised value under the provisions of Tax Code Chapter 313.<sup>1</sup> On October 16, 2018, the Comptroller issued written notice that the applicant submitted a completed application; and later issued a certificate for a limitation on appraised value on January 11, 2019. The applicant and school district executed an agreement for a limitation on appraised value (agreement) on August 29, 2019.

On September 30, 2019, Comptroller received an amendment to the agreement to move the start of the limitation from 2020 to 2022, decrease jobs and increase the project boundary. This presents the Comptroller's review of that amendment per Section 10.2 of the agreement and determinations required:

- 1) under Section 313.025(h) to determine if the property meets the requirements of Section 313.024 for eligibility for a limitation on appraised value under Chapter 313, Subchapter C; and
- 2) under Section 313.025(d), to issue a certificate for a limitation on appraised value of the property and provide the certificate to the governing body of the school district or provide the governing body a written explanation of the Comptroller's decision not to issue a certificate, using the criteria set out in Section 313.026.

**Determination required by 313.025(h)**

The information provided by the applicant related to eligibility has not changed and therefore, the Comptroller has determined that the property meets the requirements of Section 313.024 for eligibility for a limitation on appraised value under Chapter 313, Subchapter C.

<sup>1</sup> All statutory references are to the Texas Tax Code, unless otherwise noted.

**Certificate decision required by 313.025(d)**

Determination required by 313.026(c)(1)

Based on the amended information provided by the applicant, the Comptroller has determined that the project proposed by the applicant is reasonably likely to generate tax revenue in an amount sufficient to offset the school district's maintenance and operations *ad valorem tax* revenue lost as a result of the agreement before the 25th anniversary of the beginning of the limitation period, see Attachment B.

Determination required by 313.026(c)(2)

The Comptroller previously determined that the limitation on appraised value is a determining factor in the applicant's decision to invest capital and construct the project in this state.

Based on these determinations, the Comptroller issues a certificate for a limitation on appraised value for the amendment.

The Comptroller's review of the application assumes the accuracy and completeness of the statements in the application. If the application is approved by the school district, the applicant shall perform according to the provisions of the Texas Economic Development Act Agreement (Form 50-826) executed with the school district. The school district shall comply with and enforce the stipulations, provisions, terms, and conditions of the agreement, applicable Texas Administrative Code and Chapter 313, per TAC 9.1054(i)(3).

This certificate is no longer valid if the application is modified, the information presented in the application changes, or the limitation agreement does not conform to the application. Additionally, this certificate is contingent on the school district approving and executing the amendment to the agreement by December 31, 2019.

Should you have any questions, please contact Will Counihan, Director, Data Analysis & Transparency, by email at [will.counihan@cpa.texas.gov](mailto:will.counihan@cpa.texas.gov) or by phone toll-free at 1-800-531-5441, ext. 6-0758, or at 512-936-0758.

Sincerely,



Lisa Craven  
Deputy Comptroller

Enclosure

cc: Will Counihan

## Amended Attachment A – Economic Impact Analysis

The following tables summarize the Comptroller’s economic impact analysis of Clean Vision Solar, LLC (project) applying to Blooming Grove Independent School District (district), as required by Tax Code, 313.026 and Texas Administrative Code 9.1055(d)(2).

**Table 1** is a summary of investment, employment and tax impact of Clean Vision Solar, LLC.

	Original	Amendment No. 1
Applicant	Clean Vision Solar, LLC	Clean Vision Solar, LLC
Tax Code, 313.024 Eligibility Category	Renewable Energy Electric Generation- Solar	Renewable Energy Electric Generation- Solar
School District	Blooming Grove ISD	Blooming Grove ISD
2017-2018 Average Daily Attendance	865	865
County	Navarro	Navarro
Proposed Total Investment in District	\$140,000,000	\$140,000,000
Proposed Qualified Investment	\$140,000,000	\$140,000,000
Limitation Amount	\$20,000,000	\$20,000,000
Qualifying Time Period (Full Years)	2020-2021	2020-2021
Number of new qualifying jobs committed to by applicant	5*	2*
Number of new non-qualifying jobs estimated by applicant	0	0
Average weekly wage of qualifying jobs committed to by applicant	\$1,179	\$1,179
Minimum weekly wage required for each qualifying job by Tax Code, 313.021(5)(B)	\$1,179	\$1,179
Minimum annual wage committed to by applicant for qualified jobs	\$61,322	\$61,322
Minimum weekly wage required for non-qualifying jobs	\$720	\$720
Minimum annual wage required for non-qualifying jobs	\$37,428	\$37,428
Investment Per Qualifying Job	\$28,000,000	\$70,000,000
Estimated M&O levy without any limit (15 years)	\$10,054,800	\$9,590,000
Estimated M&O levy with Limitation (15 years)	\$3,672,000	\$3,750,000
Estimated gross M&O tax benefit (15 years)	\$6,382,800	\$5,840,000

\* Applicant is requesting district to waive requirement to create minimum number of qualifying jobs pursuant to Tax Code, 313.025 (f-1).

**Table 2** is the estimated statewide economic impact of Clean Vison Solar, LLC (modeled).

Year	Employment			Personal Income		
	Direct	Indirect + Induced	Total	Direct	Indirect + Induced	Total
2020	300	405	705	\$18,396,510	\$35,603,490	\$54,000,000
2021	300	424	724	\$18,396,510	\$41,603,490	\$60,000,000
2022	2	50	52	\$122,643	\$9,877,357	\$10,000,000
2023	2	16	18	\$122,643	\$5,877,357	\$6,000,000
2024	2	(14)	-12	\$122,643	\$2,877,357	\$3,000,000
2025	2	(27)	-25	\$122,643	\$877,357	\$1,000,000
2026	2	(29)	-27	\$122,643	-\$122,643	\$0
2027	2	(25)	-23	\$122,643	-\$1,122,643	-\$1,000,000
2028	2	(19)	-17	\$122,643	-\$122,643	\$0
2029	2	(11)	-9	\$122,643	-\$122,643	\$0
2030	2	(5)	-3	\$122,643	-\$122,643	\$0
2031	2	1	3	\$122,643	\$877,357	\$1,000,000
2032	2	5	7	\$122,643	\$877,357	\$1,000,000
2033	2	8	10	\$122,643	\$1,877,357	\$2,000,000
2034	2	10	12	\$122,643	\$1,877,357	\$2,000,000
2035	2	10	12	\$122,643	\$1,877,357	\$2,000,000

Source: CPA REMI, Clean Vison Solar, LLC

**Table 3** examines the estimated direct impact on ad valorem taxes to the region if all taxes are assessed.

Year	Estimated Taxable Value for I&S	Estimated Taxable Value for M&O	Tax Rate*	Blooming Grove ISD I&S Tax Levy	Blooming Grove ISD M&O Tax Levy	Blooming Grove ISD M&O and I&S Tax Levies	Navarro County Tax Levy	Navarro College County Tax Levy	Navarro Flood Control Tax Levy	Navarro Road & Bridge Tax Levy	Estimated Total Property Taxes
2021	\$35,000,000	\$35,000,000		\$17,500	\$350,000	\$367,500	\$178,815	\$42,630	\$3,150	\$37,485	\$629,580
2022	\$140,000,000	\$140,000,000		\$70,000	\$1,400,000	\$1,470,000	\$715,260	\$170,520	\$12,600	\$149,940	\$2,518,320
2023	\$126,000,000	\$126,000,000		\$63,000	\$1,260,000	\$1,323,000	\$643,734	\$153,468	\$11,340	\$134,946	\$2,266,488
2024	\$112,000,000	\$112,000,000		\$56,000	\$1,120,000	\$1,176,000	\$572,208	\$136,416	\$10,080	\$119,952	\$2,014,656
2025	\$98,000,000	\$98,000,000		\$49,000	\$980,000	\$1,029,000	\$500,682	\$119,364	\$8,820	\$104,958	\$1,762,824
2026	\$84,000,000	\$84,000,000		\$42,000	\$840,000	\$882,000	\$429,156	\$102,312	\$7,560	\$89,964	\$1,510,992
2027	\$70,000,000	\$70,000,000		\$35,000	\$700,000	\$735,000	\$357,630	\$85,260	\$6,300	\$74,970	\$1,259,160
2028	\$56,000,000	\$56,000,000		\$28,000	\$560,000	\$588,000	\$286,104	\$68,208	\$5,040	\$59,976	\$1,007,328
2029	\$42,000,000	\$42,000,000		\$21,000	\$420,000	\$441,000	\$214,578	\$51,156	\$3,780	\$44,982	\$755,496
2030	\$28,000,000	\$28,000,000		\$14,000	\$280,000	\$294,000	\$143,052	\$34,104	\$2,520	\$29,988	\$503,664
2031	\$28,000,000	\$28,000,000		\$14,000	\$280,000	\$294,000	\$143,052	\$34,104	\$2,520	\$29,988	\$503,664
2032	\$28,000,000	\$28,000,000		\$14,000	\$280,000	\$294,000	\$143,052	\$34,104	\$2,520	\$29,988	\$503,664
2033	\$28,000,000	\$28,000,000		\$14,000	\$280,000	\$294,000	\$143,052	\$34,104	\$2,520	\$29,988	\$503,664
2034	\$28,000,000	\$28,000,000		\$14,000	\$280,000	\$294,000	\$143,052	\$34,104	\$2,520	\$29,988	\$503,664
2035	\$28,000,000	\$28,000,000		\$14,000	\$280,000	\$294,000	\$143,052	\$34,104	\$2,520	\$29,988	\$503,664
2036	\$28,000,000	\$28,000,000		\$14,000	\$280,000	\$294,000	\$143,052	\$34,104	\$2,520	\$29,988	\$503,664
			<b>Total</b>	<b>\$479,500</b>	<b>\$9,590,000</b>	<b>\$10,069,500</b>	<b>\$4,899,531</b>	<b>\$1,168,062</b>	<b>\$86,310</b>	<b>\$1,027,089</b>	<b>\$17,250,492</b>

Source: CPA, Clean Vison Solar, LLC

\*Tax Rate per \$100 Valuation

**Table 4** examines the estimated direct impact on ad valorem taxes to the school district and Navarro County, with all property tax incentives sought being granted using estimated market value from the application. The project has applied for a value limitation under Chapter 313, Tax Code and tax abatement with the county and Navarro College.

The difference noted in the last line is the difference between the totals in Table 3 and Table 4.

Year	Estimated Taxable Value for I&S	Estimated Taxable Value for M&O	Tax Rate*	Blooming Grove ISD I&S Tax Levy	Blooming Grove ISD M&O Tax Levy	Blooming Grove ISD M&O and I&S Tax Levies	Navarro County Tax Levy	Navarro College County Tax Levy	Navarro Flood Control Tax Levy	Navarro Road & Bridge Tax Levy	Estimated Total Property Taxes
				0.0500	1.0000		0.5109	0.1218	0.0090	0.1071	
2021	\$35,000,000	\$35,000,000		\$17,500	\$350,000	\$367,500	\$98,348	\$23,447	\$3,150	\$37,485	\$529,930
2022	\$140,000,000	\$20,000,000		\$70,000	\$200,000	\$270,000	\$393,393	\$93,786	\$12,600	\$149,940	\$919,719
2023	\$126,000,000	\$20,000,000		\$63,000	\$200,000	\$263,000	\$354,054	\$84,407	\$11,340	\$134,946	\$847,747
2024	\$112,000,000	\$20,000,000		\$56,000	\$200,000	\$256,000	\$314,714	\$75,029	\$10,080	\$119,952	\$775,775
2025	\$98,000,000	\$20,000,000		\$49,000	\$200,000	\$249,000	\$275,375	\$65,650	\$8,820	\$104,958	\$703,803
2026	\$84,000,000	\$20,000,000		\$42,000	\$200,000	\$242,000	\$236,036	\$56,272	\$7,560	\$89,964	\$631,831
2027	\$70,000,000	\$20,000,000		\$35,000	\$200,000	\$235,000	\$196,697	\$46,893	\$6,300	\$74,970	\$559,860
2028	\$56,000,000	\$20,000,000		\$28,000	\$200,000	\$228,000	\$157,357	\$37,514	\$5,040	\$59,976	\$487,888
2029	\$42,000,000	\$20,000,000		\$21,000	\$200,000	\$221,000	\$118,018	\$28,136	\$3,780	\$44,982	\$415,916
2030	\$28,000,000	\$20,000,000		\$14,000	\$200,000	\$214,000	\$78,679	\$18,757	\$2,520	\$29,988	\$343,944
2031	\$28,000,000	\$20,000,000		\$14,000	\$200,000	\$214,000	\$143,052	\$34,104	\$2,520	\$29,988	\$423,664
2032	\$28,000,000	\$28,000,000		\$14,000	\$280,000	\$294,000	\$143,052	\$34,104	\$2,520	\$29,988	\$503,664
2033	\$28,000,000	\$28,000,000		\$14,000	\$280,000	\$294,000	\$143,052	\$34,104	\$2,520	\$29,988	\$503,664
2034	\$28,000,000	\$28,000,000		\$14,000	\$280,000	\$294,000	\$143,052	\$34,104	\$2,520	\$29,988	\$503,664
2035	\$28,000,000	\$28,000,000		\$14,000	\$280,000	\$294,000	\$143,052	\$34,104	\$2,520	\$29,988	\$503,664
2036	\$28,000,000	\$28,000,000		\$14,000	\$280,000	\$294,000	\$143,052	\$34,104	\$2,520	\$29,988	\$503,664
			<b>Total</b>	<b>\$479,500</b>	<b>\$3,750,000</b>	<b>\$4,229,500</b>	<b>\$3,080,982</b>	<b>\$734,515</b>	<b>\$86,310</b>	<b>\$1,027,089</b>	<b>\$9,158,396</b>
			<b>Diff</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$5,840,000</b>	<b>\$5,840,000</b>	<b>\$1,818,549</b>	<b>\$433,547</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$0</b>	<b>\$8,092,096</b>

Assumes School Value Limitation and Tax Abatements with the County.

Source: CPA, Clean Vison Solar, LLC

\*Tax Rate per \$100 Valuation

**Disclaimer:** This examination is based on information from the application submitted to the school district and forwarded to the comptroller. It is intended to meet the statutory requirement of Chapter 313 of the Tax Code and is not intended for any other purpose.

**Attachment B – Tax Revenue before 25<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of Limitation Start**

This represents the Comptroller’s determination that Clean Vision Solar, LLC (project) is reasonably likely to generate, before the 25th anniversary of the beginning of the limitation period, tax revenue in an amount sufficient to offset the school district maintenance and operations ad valorem tax revenue lost as a result of the agreement. This evaluation is based on an analysis of the estimated M&O portion of the school district property tax levy directly related to this project, using estimated taxable values provided in the application.

	Tax Year	Estimated ISD M&O Tax Levy Generated (Annual)	Estimated ISD M&O Tax Levy Generated (Cumulative)	Estimated ISD M&O Tax Levy Loss as Result of Agreement (Annual)	Estimated ISD M&O Tax Levy Loss as Result of Agreement (Cumulative)
<b>Limitation Pre-Years</b>	2019	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
	2020	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
	2021	\$350,000	\$350,000	\$0	\$0
<b>Limitation Period (10 Years)</b>	2022	\$200,000	\$550,000	\$1,200,000	\$1,200,000
	2023	\$200,000	\$750,000	\$1,060,000	\$2,260,000
	2024	\$200,000	\$950,000	\$920,000	\$3,180,000
	2025	\$200,000	\$1,150,000	\$780,000	\$3,960,000
	2026	\$200,000	\$1,350,000	\$640,000	\$4,600,000
	2027	\$200,000	\$1,550,000	\$500,000	\$5,100,000
	2028	\$200,000	\$1,750,000	\$360,000	\$5,460,000
	2029	\$200,000	\$1,950,000	\$220,000	\$5,680,000
	2030	\$200,000	\$2,150,000	\$80,000	\$5,760,000
	2031	\$200,000	\$2,350,000	\$80,000	\$5,840,000
<b>Maintain Viable Presence (5 Years)</b>	2032	\$280,000	\$2,630,000	\$0	\$5,840,000
	2033	\$280,000	\$2,910,000	\$0	\$5,840,000
	2034	\$280,000	\$3,190,000	\$0	\$5,840,000
	2035	\$280,000	\$3,470,000	\$0	\$5,840,000
	2036	\$280,000	\$3,750,000	\$0	\$5,840,000
<b>Additional Years as Required by 313.026(c)(1) (10 Years)</b>	2037	\$280,000	\$4,030,000	\$0	\$5,840,000
	2038	\$280,000	\$4,310,000	\$0	\$5,840,000
	2039	\$280,000	\$4,590,000	\$0	\$5,840,000
	2040	\$280,000	\$4,870,000	\$0	\$5,840,000
	2041	\$280,000	\$5,150,000	\$0	\$5,840,000
	2042	\$280,000	\$5,430,000	\$0	\$5,840,000
	2043	\$280,000	\$5,710,000	\$0	\$5,840,000
	2044	\$280,000	\$5,990,000	\$0	\$5,840,000
	2045	\$280,000	\$6,270,000	\$0	\$5,840,000
	2046	\$280,000	\$6,550,000	\$0	\$5,840,000

**\$6,550,000** is greater than **\$5,840,000**

<b>Analysis Summary</b>	
Is the project reasonably likely to generate tax revenue in an amount sufficient to offset the M&O levy loss as a result of the limitation agreement?	Yes

Source: CPA, Clean Vision Solar, LLC

**Disclaimer:** This examination is based on information from the application submitted to the school district and forwarded to the comptroller. It is intended to meet the statutory requirement of Chapter 313 of the Tax Code and is not intended for any other purpose.